Introduction

Part 1 [1] of this paper presented the clinical case study of Bill: a participant in the research study investigating the role of relationships completion in palliative care music therapy. Part II presents a brief overview of the research study, and the description of Bill’s case study (one of the four primary participants). The study sought to answer the primary question: What is the experience of a dying person engaged in a specific music therapy treatment program intended to facilitate relationship completion? The investigation was a phenomenological qualitative inquiry that included multiple data sources analyzed through a process coding of the data and identifying themes.

Data Analysis

Transcription. The researcher transcribed all music therapy sessions recordings, session notes, and interviews. Analysis of the interviews included: a transcription of literal statements, non-verbal and paralinguistic communication; and listening to the interview for an appreciation of the whole. (3) This included: listening to each interview multiple times to provide a framework for the emergence of themes and units of meaning. Non-verbal data present in the sessions, was analyzed using a coding key for long pauses between words and hesitancies in the speaker’s voice.

Reading through the data. Each transcription was read multiple times by the researcher to increase the understanding of the material. The researcher also read and listened to additional materials. As the researcher read through these materials, quotes and information that could be used to introduce the participant and provide the necessary participant history for the case study were highlighted.

Identifying themes and coding the data. After initial readings the researcher re-read the transcriptions and the additional materials to identify themes. Data were coded from words or phrases found in the transcripts, and from the researcher’s
awareness of the occurrence of music therapy to facilitate relationship completion. This began with the assessment and a reading of the materials in the chronological order with from the beginning to the end of the music therapy process. Each participant’s case yielded multiple themes that were then organized into collapsed codes and further into themes and sub-themes.

Ethical Considerations
Ethical approval was received from Baycrest and the University of Toronto. All participants’ names were kept confidential, and in the presentation and/or publication of these research results all participants’ names have been changed.

Results: Bill’s Clinical Case

Thematic Analysis: Bill’s and Sarah’s Experience of Music Therapy Sessions Intended to Facilitate Relationship Completion

In looking back over all of the data sources (researcher’s session notes, transcriptions of recorded music therapy sessions, pre-composed songs used in therapy sessions, the original song compositions, the interviews, the researcher’s formal assessment placed in the chart, and Bill’s artistic piece) and coding them, it appears that seven large themes emerged namely: love; gratitude; grieving; urgency; heroes; Judaism; and stories. Within these themes there are two sub-themes. The following section discusses and unpacks the themes and the sub-themes as they unfolded during the course of music therapy treatment and identifies how the sub-themes contribute to the seven overall themes.

Theme 1: Love
Love was a prominent theme that emerged throughout the music therapy process. It surfaced as Bill told me about his marriage to Rebecca and it was present in the story of courting and marrying Sarah. He articulated his good fortune in marrying two wonderful women. Bill expressed that these were the two most important relationships to him, and this awareness directed our course of music therapy to include the goals of completing his relationships with Rebecca and Sarah.

As Bill focused and decided on the stories he would include in “Heroes,” love was at the foundation of each story we discussed. As Bill spoke about Rebecca’s death he expressed the love he shared with her and the wonderful marriage they had. He acknowledged the void that Rebecca’s death left in his life.

She was courageous, graceful, understanding, sympathetic, and loving.

In “Launching” we discussed these stories in greater detail and love was very present in his reminiscences. In recounting his courting, marriage, honeymoon, and first anniversary with Sarah, Bill spoke of his loving relationship with her. Love was the basis for the song he wrote for Sarah to accompany the story of their first anniversary. Bill’s poem The Love I Feel for You Sarah is a beautiful expression of his love. The following is an excerpt from that song.

So at this first anniversary,
I celebrate my love for thee,
I say to thee on bended knee,
It is a lasting certainty,
I will love you always.

In selecting the song to accompany the story “Courting of Sarah,” Bill worked the song It Had to Be You into the scene that was based on their first date. Bill had written a poem for Sarah’s 75th birthday, a poem of gratitude and love for her. As Bill had misplaced this poem, he decided to write a new one that we set to music. In discussing and writing this song, Bill identified his wishes for Sarah once he died. He longed for her to engage in life and to surround herself with the love of family and friends. These wishes were an outward sign of his love for her. He did not want her to be lonely or to spend time grieving his death. He wished for her to reach new milestones and to continue living life fully.

I want to tell her that I love her, and that she must keep living the years she has.

In speaking about Joseph’s death Bill said:

Joseph was not strong due to his illness, but he was loved and he loved others.

Joseph loved many things in life. He had a passion for gardening and for studying the Torah. He loved his grandmother Sarah, and his love provided comfort for Sarah as she grieved the death of her first husband.

In planning the sessions with Sarah, Bill wanted to share the story of their first anniversary from his play and to present the love song he had written for her. After Sarah and Bill read from the play and listened to the love song in session 24 they said:

You know I love you don’t you? I wanted you to know this. It is so hard for me to tell you that sometimes in a serious way, but I want you to know this.

S: “I do Bill and I love you too.”

Their expressions were affirmations of the love they had for each other as well as acknowledgements that they knew their spouses loved them.
In session 25, as we reflected on Joseph’s death, Sarah acknowledged her love for Joseph. She also recognized that she was supported by loving family and friends when both her husband and Joseph died.

Love was highly prominent in session 26 as Bill presented the song *Gratitude* to Sarah. Sarah had also brought a poem to that session that Bill wrote for her in commemoration of the anniversary of their first date. She commented on how romantic Bill was. Sarah said:

*I feel very loved.*

In Bill’s interview he stated that songwriting helped him express his feelings for Sarah which included the sentiment of love. Sarah’s love was evident in the last two music therapy sessions as we sang songs at Bill’s bedside.

**Theme 2: Gratitude**

Gratitude was a part of all of the stories Bill shared with me. In our assessment sessions Bill imparted feelings of gratitude for being raised by such a good mother. He acknowledged her generosity and caring. There was appreciation of home cooked meals and nursing care that she provided to her family and neighbors. He spoke of the blessing of being part of the good home his parents provided for him and his siblings, a home that was infused with love, music, and Jewish traditions.

Bill also spoke about the blessings in his life having known and marrying two amazing women.

*I have been so blessed in my life to have known such a gentle and courageous woman. I am doubly blessed however as I have been fortunate to meet another amazing woman.*

Bill also appreciated Sarah’s family, in particular Bette who had supported him throughout his illness.

In “Focusing” as Bill concentrated on the story of Rebecca’s death and funeral, the theme of gratitude was in the background as expressions of love and grief were more prominent. In “Launching,” the theme of gratitude came back to the forefront. There was gratitude in finding Sarah to share his life with after the death of Rebecca, and finding this new lover to inspire, awaken, and heal him.

*I was wounded and Sarah healed my soul.  
My mind had numbed and Sarah awakened me.  
My love of language dimmed, but Sarah inspired me.*

As Bill told me about his meetings with the Rabbi when he and Sarah were preparing for their wedding, he was thankful for the support of his loving family and friends and of the Temple that had facilitated his introduction to Sarah. Recounting the story of their honeymoon Bill expressed appreciation for those that died in the Holocaust and for those that died fighting for Israeli independence.

Reflecting on Joseph’s life, Bill was thankful for Joseph’s care and devotion to Sarah as he grieved the death of her first husband. In telling the story of Sarah’s 75th birthday, gratitude was prominent. He wanted to write a song in appreciation of Sarah.

*I want to thank her for our marriage and for her role in bringing me out of my sorrow over the death of Rebecca.*

As Bill continued to write the play, and selected and wrote songs in “Vehicles/Tools,” gratitude was evident in Bill’s words for the song *Gratitude.*

*I have said that I am grateful to be married to Sarah, and grateful that she married me, but I have not thanked her for being her, for being the friend and love that she is.*

When Sarah joined us in sessions, she expressed gratitude for Bill’s poetry writing, songwriting, humor, and romance. In session 26 Bill expressed the second sentiment he needed to tell Sarah to help him complete his relationship with her, “Thank You.”

*Thank you for taking me as your husband.  
Thank you for being my friend and my wife.*

In their interviews Bill and Sarah expressed gratitude for taking part in music therapy and acknowledged the role music played in helping them discuss important issues such as Joseph’s death and Bill’s impending death.

**Theme 3: Grieving**

Grieving was a theme that surrounded the entire music therapy process with Bill and Sarah. In the assessment phase the theme of grieving surfaced as Bill told me about the deaths of Rebecca and Joseph. Bill identified that writing poetry helped him in processing and ultimately grieving Rebecca’s death. He expressed his anxiety and concern for Sarah and Bette in their difficulties grieving Joseph’s death, and acknowledged that they were both still in a period of bereavement. His worry was prompted by the love he held for Sarah and Bette, and his concerns weighed heavily on him as he was unsure of how Sarah in particular would grieve and cope with his death. In setting the goals for music therapy sessions, Bill focused on completing his relationships with Rebecca and Sarah. Inherent in this process would be grieving the loss of Rebecca, and grieving the future losses of being separated from Sarah in death and sharing future milestones with her.

In “Focusing,” Bill selected the time period of his life that the play would capture. He decided on the last 10 years which began with his experience of Rebecca’s death and his grieving process at that time.
Well, we have to include the funeral of Rebecca. That was the most traumatic thing that has happened to me.

Through discussing Rebecca’s illness and death, Bill expressed loss over living life without his wife who embodied so many exceptional qualities including: grace, courage, understanding, love, and intelligence. He expressed sadness in the loss of his life partner, companion, lover, and friend. When we began writing the song for Rebecca, Bill noted that the song should be about losing her and having to learn to live without her.

In “Launching,” grief and loss were present in each of the stories we discussed for the play. Bill maintained that the story “Courting of Sarah” was:

…A tale of grief, redemption, defeat, and triumph.

In discussing the story for the “Marriage to Sarah,” Bill spoke of the loss of friends and family who had died and would not be with them on their wedding day or as they celebrated important milestones and events in the couple’s life together. As Bill spoke of his trip to Israel for their honeymoon he conveyed expressions of loss, grief, sadness, and admiration for those persons who lost their lives fighting for Israeli independence and dying in the Holocaust.

The theme of griefing was not as prominent in the sharing of “Bill and Sarah’s First Wedding Anniversary,” but it was still present as Bill reflected on that wonderful day and his love for Sarah. In discussing this story, writing the poem and song for Sarah, Bill was cognizant of the loss of not sharing more anniversaries with Sarah, and ultimately the loss of being separated from this beautiful person.

The story of Joseph’s death is about death, grief, and coping. Sadness was expressed for the illness that Joseph endured and the pain that was a result of that illness. Grief was expressed for Joseph who waited for a kidney transplant only to have the operation prove unsuccessful. There was also recognition that Joseph had been instrumental in helping Sarah grieve the death of her first husband.

As Bill re-told the story of “Sarah’s 75th Birthday,” he expressed loss over not reaching further milestones in his life and articulated his difficulty in speaking to Sarah about his death. In working towards inviting Sarah to our sessions, Bill wanted to thank Sarah for her role in helping him out of his period of mourning over Rebecca’s death.

In “Vehicles/Tools,” Bill named his play, “Heroes.” In the play’s prologue Bill pays tribute to Rebecca and Sarah for being strong courageous women who were courageous through death, damage, and disaster. Grief surfaced again as we selected music for “Joseph’s Death” and in the writing of Rebecca’s Song and Gratitude. Rebecca’s Song was about Bill’s grieving process surrounding her death. The song’s lyrics clearly speak to his grief experience.

His voice tearing at the sharp edge of his grief.
Come now friends pick up the pieces.
Because you see, we’re like a tree. Its branches withered, sap run dry.

As Bill worked towards completing his relationship with Sarah, there was grief as Bill became more aware of his need to thank Sarah in preparing for his loss of life. He needed to say “Thank You” before he died and ultimately, before time ran out. When Sarah joined us in sessions, discussions arose that centered on loss, grieving, and bereavement.

In their interviews, Bill and Sarah acknowledged the role that music had played in helping them discuss loss and grief, and the importance of doing that to facilitate Bill in having a more peaceful death. Love was most prominent in those weeks.

Theme 4: Urgency
The theme of urgency surrounded our work in music therapy. This theme presented itself when Bill and I met and he told me about writing his memoirs.

I don’t have much energy as I did before, but I need to finish them.

Bill expressed urgency in completing his memoirs before he died as his energy was fading as a result of the cancer. Bill had participated in many groups throughout his life and there appeared to be a sense of importance in those engagements. He studied and practiced law but there was a necessity for Bill to find more in life and he pursued drama and writing.

Speaking about Sarah and her grieving of Joseph’s death, Bill conveyed pressing concern for Sarah’s ability to continue to process that death with his death looming. He needed to know that friends and family would be there to support her, and he needed to speak to Sarah about his desire for her to seek assistance or counseling in processing Joseph’s as well as his impending death.

I am worried that when I die she will not have anyone to help her.

As Bill became engaged in music therapy sessions he expressed his desire to write a play based on his memoirs. Bill craved creativity and alternative methods of expression in his last days. He longed for continued growth and was motivated by his creativity and dedication to leave his mark on this world. He wanted his life to be remembered.

Theme 5: Heroes
As defined by Merriam-Webster [4] the word hero refers to:

a mythological or legendary figure often of divine descent endowed with great strength or ability; an illustrious
warrior; a man admired for his achievements and noble qualities; one that shows great courage; (or,) an object of extreme admiration and devotion. (¶1)

Bill often referred to people in his life as heroes. While I never asked Bill what his definition of the word “hero” was, it appeared that his definition included persons who were admired for their achievements, devotion, and exceptional or unique qualities; and persons who showed strength and courage. From the stories he told me and wrote about, it appeared that many people in his life fit this description. Throughout his life Bill had been surrounded by heroes and his brave and creative facing of death is perhaps its own hero’s journey.

As Bill told me about his parents and his life growing up in Ontario, the heroes theme surfaced. His parents had left Lithuania to escape persecution. They moved to Canada to start a new life and they pursued their dream of owning property and building a good, loving, and stable home for their growing family. Bill’s father established a successful business which afforded the family to move several times, each time into a larger home with additional comforts. Bill’s father was a hero who was admired by his family and friends for his hard work, successful business, courage in moving and starting a new life, and devotion to his family.

My dad was always trying to make life better for his family. He worked very hard, but my mother’s energy was legendary.

Bill held great admiration for his mother. He averred that she was skilled in many areas and that their community referred to her as the “town nurse." Without formal training his mother was able to provide medical advice and treatment to her family and neighbours with home-made remedies she has learned throughout her life. Bill’s mother was admired by many. Her care and concern for others, dedication to her family, and work ethic made her a “hero.”

When Bill was in University, he joined a Zionist movement that was created to help establish a homeland for the Jewish people in Palestine. Bill admired these displaced Jewish persons for their courage and perseverance in the face of difficult life circumstances. He also held unwavering respect and honour for those that died in the Holocaust. These persons were heroes who showed courage and strength as they entered war camps and were killed in gas chambers. Bill’s admiration for the Jewish people became even more clearly visible as he spoke about his trip with Sarah to Israel for their honeymoon. They visited Yad Vashem and passed many tributes to Israeli soldiers. The Jewish people who lost their lives fighting for independence, and those who were murdered mercilessly were heroes.

Bill described Rebecca as a woman who was admired by family and friends as well as a person who inspired others. She created a loving home for her family and she was devoted to Bill and her children. Rebecca showed courage and bravery in her battle with cancer as she suffered remarkably from the treatments.

She was courageous, graceful, understanding, sympathetic, and loving.

Rebecca was a hero.
Joseph had suffered for a large part of his short life. He was admired by his family and friends for his bravery and passion for knowledge. Sarah held Joseph in high regard for his caring nature that provided her comfort in grieving the death of her first husband.

But Sarah tells me he really lived with courage, patience, and humour.

Joseph was a hero.
Bill respected Bette for her commitment to her family and friends, for welcoming him into Sarah’s family, and for staying by his side throughout his illness. He admired the strength she showed after having lost her son. While Bill was concerned for Bette, it was not for a lack of strength or courage that she showed, but rather for the fact that his death (that would occur so close to that of Joseph’s) would place incredible strain on both her and Sarah. For her courage to live life after the death of her son, and for her devotion to family, Bette is a hero.

Bill admired Sarah for many of her qualities. He spoke highly of his fortune in meeting such a remarkable woman who was his friend and lover, and who while grieving the death of her grandchild provided understanding and care to Bill in his days at the hospital. Bill maintained that Sarah had given him back his spirit after losing Rebecca. She was caring and inspirational to both Bill and her family. She showed courage living the past 11 years, losing her first husband, and her grandchild. Bill wrote:

I am unworthy of thy grace.

Sarah is a hero.
In my eyes Bill was a hero; however I am aware that Bill’s humble nature would prevent him for seeing himself in this category. Bill had fought in his life for just causes, had survived a heart attack, and persevered in his battle with cancer working tirelessly to finish his memoirs. He showed courage in facing life without Rebecca and sought to heal himself with poetry and new engagements in life. Sarah acknowledged that Bill was admired and loved by his family and friends, and he was respected in the Jewish community. The concern, care, and love that Bill expressed for Sarah and Bette demonstrated his devotion to family. I admired Bill for his pursuit of excellence, and dedication to our music therapy
process. Bill was a hero.

Fittingly, Bill titled the play he wrote “Heroes.”

**Theme 6: Judaism**

Bill grew up in a Jewish family and continued to be observant through adolescence and his adult life. Bill’s family had cultivated a sense of their Jewish culture and heritage into their children, and as a young adult Bill joined the Zionist movement to help the people of Israel. Bill and Rebecca raised their children in the Jewish faith and culture. After Rebecca died Bill joined the “Lunch and Learn” series at his Temple and it was there that he met Sarah. In “Launching,” Bill told me about their meetings with the Rabbi who guided them in preparation for their wedding. While at Baycrest, Bill was visited by the staff Rabbi who provided counsel and support to him in preparation for his death, and the Rabbi that married Bill and Sarah officiated at Bill’s funeral service.

The values and traditions that Bill had learned and embraced from his engagement in Jewish life were core to his character and the way he presented himself. He was an honourable man who respected and embraced his heritage, and Judaism was a core part of Bill’s stories.

**Theme 7: Stories**

Contributing to the larger theme of stories are the sub-themes of the arts, and living. Bill led a storied life, and our music therapy process is a story. From the day I met Bill he told me numerous stories from all parts of his life. Our music therapy process began with Bill telling me about his memoirs and sharing the book he had written that included stories from his life beginning in childhood. In the assessment phase, Bill explained to me that when he could not sleep he jotted down ideas in a notebook. He used these ideas to write stories. While at the hospital, Bill spent every morning writing stories for his memoirs and once we had established our music therapy goals which included writing a play, Bill spent the mornings also writing for the play.

In “Focusing,” Bill decided that the play should be based on the last 10 years of his life as he had not yet written all the stories that he needed to from this time period. Bill had stories that needed to be told. In “Launching,” a large part of our time together was spent discussing the stories for his play and Bill continued to write throughout the “Vehicles/Tools” phase. He finished his memoirs but did not finish the last act of his play. I was honoured that Bill asked me to write this for him. When Sarah joined us in sessions Bill, Sarah, and I read selected stories from his play with her. Sarah said:

> Well Bill, I see your writing is still up to your high standards.

Stories were a way to express feelings, thoughts, and concerns. Once expressed, Bill was able to discuss his feelings with Sarah directly. In Sarah’s interview she remarked:

> I am so pleased that Bill wrote the play. He always wrote beautiful poems for me, and he loves drama.

At Bill’s funeral and shiva many of his family members and friends shared their favourite stories about Bill.

**Sub-theme: The Arts**

Poetry and the performing arts had played a role throughout Bill’s life and they were core to our music therapy process. Bill described his family as musical, while admitting that he was not a musician. He grew up with a brother who played the violin and a sister who played the piano. Myra became Bill’s piano teacher for a year until Bill admitted not having the dedication at that time to learn this instrument. He spoke fondly of the music his family shared at their Friday night concerts. Bill was also drawn to drama and joined an acting club in University. He stated that he had wanted to be an actor as opposed to being a lawyer.

In the assessment phase Bill said:

> Music has been a large part of my life. I used to love to go dancing.

Bill expressed enthusiasm about participating in music therapy sessions and embraced the opportunity to write a play based on his memoirs, a play that would include both songs that he would write and pre-composed songs. Bill averred that songs would make the play better.

When Bill told me about Rebecca, he acknowledged that he had been drawn to poetry to help him process his feelings over losing her. Bill had also written poems for Sarah in celebration of special events. In “Focusing,” Bill decided to write a song for Sarah based on a poem he would craft about their first wedding anniversary.

It was also during this time that we began the process of assessing what music would augment Bill’s play by engaging in lyric discussion and analysis, song selection, and songwriting. As we continued this process in “Launching” and “Vehicles/Tools,” it was becoming clear to Bill that music was adding a new dimension to his stories, one that he was pleased with. Bill stated that music was adding emotion to the stories, and his stories were told more thoroughly with the musical additions. The process of adding music to the new stories brought Bill to fresh insights about his stories, and it also brought him awareness of feelings and thoughts that he needed to express to Sarah.

In Bill’s interview he told me that he was happy with the play.

> I think I liked songwriting the most. It was very creative, poetry writing, but on a higher level.

He was aware of the role that music played in helping him share his stories and come to new assessments that facilitated needed discussions with Sarah.

> Yes, music was helpful to me. I always have written and
that has helped me tell my stories. Now there are stories and songs about my life.

The arts contributed to the larger theme of stories as they provided additional tools for expression. Bill wanted to complete his memoirs and he became intrigued by also writing a play to share his stories. By writing poems and using music to augment his stories, the stories were more completely expressed. Bill’s stories were a work of art.

Sub-theme: Living
Bill lived life to the fullest. As Sarah stated in her interview:

S: Bill was able to live while he was here. I think I can say that Bill lived his last days here, instead of saying he died here.

Living contributes to the larger theme of stories as all of Bill’s stories involved engaging in a variety of life experiences. Bill lived his life surrounded by loving relationships. He worked as a lawyer, but always sought out additional pursuits to enrich his life, experiences that would engage him.

His stories contain many lessons on how to live. They are stories of loving, grieving, traveling, celebrating, caring, and playing. Bill lived life in the face of challenges, death, and illness. He was very driven to finish his memoirs in order to share his life stories and ultimately leave his mark on this world.

Bill’s stories were an affirmation and example of living life.

Figure 1 provides a summary of the themes that emerged in Bill’s experience.

![Themes Chart](Image)

CONCLUSION

In writing my reflections on the various phases of our music therapy sessions, I used quotes from Bill and Sarah to confirm the examination of my own observations and assessments. There were a variety of music therapy techniques that worked together in aiding Bill to accomplish his goals. The differing levels of music therapy practice were equally important in seeing the goals come to fruition. “Focusing” helped Bill create the outline for his play and he identified the stories he needed to include. “Launching” helped Bill identify the sentiments he needed to express to both Rebecca and Sarah in order to complete his relationships with them. In the “Vehicles/Tools” phase, Bill completed his memoirs and was successful in completing his relationships with Rebecca and Sarah.

With respect to relationship completion, the most significant music therapy techniques according to Bill in his experience were: songwriting, and lyric analysis and discussion. Bill said:

*By learning about the importance of doing this, (Referring to relationship completion) I was able to complete my relationship with Sarah. I feel much better now that I have thanked her for giving me life these last years.*

The lyrics of pre-composed songs helped Bill express the emotions that were held in his stories more thoroughly. They also helped him come to new awareness about the sentiments he needed to express to Sarah before he died. Writing the songs for Sarah proved to be a tool to present and convey those feelings in order to discuss them with Sarah.

In reviewing all the data, it appears that four music therapy techniques were essential to his experience of relationship completion. These were songwriting, lyric discussion and analysis, song choice, and playing and singing pre-composed songs.

Music therapy provided Bill with a place to explore his stories and the tools to bring those stories to life. It also provided him with the awareness of expressing his concerns and sentiments to Sarah in order for him to have a more peaceful death.

References


Biographical Statements

Amy Clements-Cortés, PhD, RP, MTA, MT-BC, FAMI is Assistant Professor, Faculty of Music, University of Toronto; Academic Coordinator, Ryerson Chang School, Toronto, Canada.